

Michael Gehr, chair, called the meeting to order at 4:42 p.m. on Thursday, March 24, 2016, in the Conference Room, Fourth Floor, City Hall. A roster of the members of the commission and the technical posts they fill are on file and available upon request. Also present were commission members L. Allen, C. Davis, and S. Silas. S. Bockmiller, Development Planner/Zoning Administrator, and D. Calhoun, Secretary, were present on behalf of the Planning and Code Administration Department.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES – February 11, 2016:

MOTION: (Davis/Allen) So moved (to adopt the minutes as submitted).
DISCUSSION: None.
ACTION: APPROVED (Unanimous)

CONSENT AGENDA

12 West Franklin Street – Barbara Smith – Window Lettering, Case No. HDC 2016-03.

There was no opposition from the public or from the commission.

MOTION: (Davis/Silas) Mr. Chairman, I have reviewed the materials submitted in Case HDC 2016-03, 12 West Franklin Street, and its associated staff report and recommendation, and I have viewed the property in question. The staff report recommends approval of this application as consistent with the applicable standards adopted by the Commission, and no one has appeared at this hearing with concerns about, issues with, or objections to this application. Therefore, I move that this Commission adopt the staff evaluations and recommendations in this case as its own and grant a Certificate of Appropriateness to the applicant for Case No. HDC 2016-03.
DISCUSSION: None.
ACTION: APPROVED (Unanimous)

DESIGN REVIEW

17 East Avenue – Mark Bartel – Stairway Addition, Case No. HDC 2016-02.

Mark Bartel, property owner, was present.

Staff Report: This is a “B” resource in the Downtown Local Historic District. Applicant proposes to construct a stairwell addition on the east side of this building. The new stairwell enclosure will contain four Jeldwen one-over-one vinyl windows (two on the south elevation and two on the east

elevation); siding will be HardiPlank® Lap siding; entry door to be YKK AP Tubelite anodized aluminum entrance door; standing seam metal roof; and a vinyl guardrail system on the second floor porch will replace the existing lattice work. Staff recommended approval. The color of the railing and door frame should be coordinated with the planned trim color on the house (presumably white). The door should not be left bare aluminum or give the appearance of a metal door. The project includes the use of some modern material. Staff consulted with Dr. Paula Reed, the commission's architectural historian, and Dr. Reed advised that she did not have concerns about the use of modern material in this case given that the building will be used for commercial purposes and that the work is not part of the primary facade.

Applicant/Commission Discussion: Mr. Bartel noted that the aluminum entry door will be painted, although it will not be white like the trim work. It will either be a dark bronze or burgundy. Mr. Bockmiller stated as long as the door does not appear to be a metal door, he would not have any concerns.

MOTION: (Silas/Davis) Mr. Chairman, I have inspected the project plans and the property in question and if constructed in accordance with these plans and no specific stipulations other than the door should not have a metallic appearance, that the height, setback, materials, architectural detailing, windows, general form and proportion are generally in harmony with the Architectural Design Guidelines for Downtown Historic District and the character of the adjoining properties. Therefore, I move that the HDC grant a Certificate of Appropriateness to the applicant for Case No. HDC 2016-02.

DISCUSSION: None.

ACTION: APPROVED (Unanimous)

222 South Prospect Street – Carol Thompson – Front Porch Alterations, Case No. HDC 2016-04.

Carol Thompson, property owner, and Mike Roberts, 222 South Prospect Street, Hagerstown, Maryland, were present.

Staff Report: This is a contributing resource in the Prospect Street Local Historic District. Applicant has replaced the rotted wood flooring on the front porch with Trex® composite flooring (same color as existing) and the rotted front stairs and railing with pressure-treated framing, Trex® treads, and vinyl composite railing which will be painted. Staff had no recommendation on this case, but noted that the railing along the steps, recently replaced, did not appear to be original to the building. The Design Guidelines do not recommend the use of modern replacement products on highly visible areas, especially on front facades. Staff pointed out that there is a solid railing that conceals most of the work that has been done.

Applicant/Commission Discussion: Mr. Roberts brought with him painted samples of the materials for the commission to examine. When he lowered the height of the risers on the stairs he did not realize that a permit was required. In response to an observation by Mr. Gehr, Mr. Roberts noted that he has the leading edge for the ends of the porch floor boards but has not had an opportunity to install it yet. Staff recommended that if the commission was inclined to approve this work, a finding should be made about a unique circumstance that would warrant the deviation from the guidelines, such as the fact that the solid railing mostly conceals the modern materials that were used. Commission members noted that the baluster is very similar to the baluster that is shown on photographs from the early 2000s. Commission members had no concerns about this proposal.

MOTION: (Davis/Silas) Mr. Chairman, I have inspected the project plans and the property in question and since it is constructed in accordance with this plan and the project is concealed mostly by a solid railing it still looks from the street to be reasonably historic and is generally in harmony with the Architectural Design Guidelines for the Residential Preservation Design District and the character of the adjoining properties. Therefore, I move that the HDC grant a Certificate of Appropriateness to the applicant for Case No. HDC 2016-04.

DISCUSSION: Ms. Allen offered an amendment that the steps on the front of the porch were revised to come in compliance with the building code of the seven-inch riser height. Ms. Davis and Mr. Silas agreed to the amendment to the motion.

ACTION: APPROVED, AS AMENDED (Unanimous)

WORKSHOP

33 Summit Avenue – Bradley Moss - Alterations.

Bradley Moss has an interest in this property and wanted to discuss several renovations with the commission. First, the side porch needs maintenance work—the existing Plexiglas is popping out. The proposed use would be for a restaurant, and Mr. Moss asked whether the second floor of the porch could be expanded to cantilever over the private sidewalk along the south side of the building. This would allow them to get some extra space and provide a view over Summit Avenue. Mr. Moss asked for advice on the types of materials they might be able to use. Mr. Bockmiller stated that the existing porch is not significant. Mr. Gehr noted that the porch area is a modern addition so modern materials would not be out of the question. Also a cantilevered second floor porch would provide a covered entrance area. Because the restaurant plans to serve alcohol, the outdoor seating area would need to be fenced.

With regard to materials, commission members advised that any materials used would need to be compatible with the building and proportionate with the size of the building. If Mr. Moss were to

maintain “the look going across the building,” there should be no issues. The roof on the back of the porch appears to be flat, with mechanical equipment on top. Mr. Moss was advised to consider a mansard to help screen the equipment. The porch could have a modern look as long as it is compatible with the historic front portion of the building. Posts will be needed to help support the cantilever. Mr. Moss stated that an elevator will be required. The project would be completed in phases with work starting in the front (historic) portion of the building. The kitchen would be located in the back building. Catering would be an element of the project so the kitchen in the back of the building would be advantageous for loading purposes.

There is a two-tiered stone wall in the back yard. Mr. Moss would like to make the wall taller to conceal an existing chain link fence and a guardrail. Mr. Gehr noted that they will need to decide whether to remove the cap or build on top of the cap.

Mr. Bockmiller provided information on window lettering and signage. Lettering on the window can be up to 50% of the window space. Flat-mounted signs are limited to one square foot per linear foot of the front façade regardless of which façade the sign is located. Projecting signs can be no larger than eight square feet and the square footage of a wall sign is figured separately from projecting signs.

Concerning the replacement windows on the second floor porch, commission members observed that the new windows will more than likely be aluminum storefront windows. Another option would be a grouping of wood windows. With “awning windows” there are certain distances in the building code that dictate the size of the window. Sliders might be another window option for the porch.

Mr. Moss also noted that the rear building has large wire laden panes of glass. Commission members encouraged him to keep/restore these windows. Mr. Moss asked whether awnings would need approval of the HDC. Mr. Gehr stated they do need to be approved and would be required to have a valance of a minimum width. Lettering can be placed on the awnings but is not necessary. As a general rule of thumb, Mr. Bockmiller advised that any outside changes to the building need to be reviewed by the HDC.

- MOTION:** (Davis/Silas) Mr. Chairman, I move to modify the agenda to make the change from “Washington” to “Franklin” Street for the first case (Consent Agenda); and to add the Hagerstown Cultural Trail for discussion under the Workshop portion of the agenda.
- DISCUSSION:** None.
- ACTION:** APPROVED (Unanimous)

Hagerstown Cultural Trail.

Staff presented the small portion of the Hagerstown Cultural Trail (Trail) that is located in the Downtown Historic District. The trail extends from West Antietam Street to Park Circle. The small section of the trail that is in the Historic district is about six feet wide between the Antietam Paper Company building and the Herald-Mail property. The final plat and the site plan are going to be before the Planning Commission for approval on March 30. In the historic district, the proposed work is mainly landscaping and converting paving to grass.

Mr. Gehr had concerns about the dock doors, which will not be functional without a dock. An official application will be filed by the City Engineer's office for the improvements in the six-foot area. Staff requested a motion in support of the concept for the portion of the Trail located in the historic district.

MOTION: (Davis/Silas) I move to approve the site plan with the specific details to be provided in the future.

DISCUSSION: None.

ACTION: APPROVED (Unanimous)

Mr. Bockmiller noted that the City hopes to begin work on the project within two weeks. He had a copy of the artwork plan for the commission's perusal.

2016 Preservation Awards – Call for Nominations.

Staff proposed the following properties for consideration of preservation awards. Commission members were asked to think about other properties that could be recognized with awards.

- 115-117 South Potomac Street – This project is not quite complete. All the vinyl siding has been removed; however some of the windows are still boarded up. Commission members agreed with this nomination.
- 51 East Franklin Street – Removed the vinyl siding and restored the historic storefront. Commission members agreed with this nomination.
- First Hose Fire Co. Archival Center – This is interior work, but the fire company did a great job exposing the tin ceilings. Commission members agreed with this nomination.
- 71 West Franklin Street (corner of West Franklin and Jonathan Streets) – The owner replaced the hodge-podge of windows on these storefronts and also brought the bay window into compliance. Commission members agreed with this nomination.
- 43-45 South Potomac Street (former Ben's Flower Shop) – The replacement windows are modern but they did a good job of matching the historic windows. Commission members agreed with this nomination.

- 100 North Potomac Street (The Patterson Building). Commission members agreed with this nomination.
- Rose Hill Cemetery has offered to fund the reprinting of the updated Civil War Walking Tour Map. Commission members advised that a resolution by the Mayor and City Council would be a better way to recognize Rose Hill Cemetery for their generosity.
- Ms. Allen suggested the house at the corner of North Potomac Street and North Avenue. The owner is doing a good job restoring the façade/bay windows. Commission members asked to wait on this one until next year.

Mr. Bockmiller will provide a memo in the next packet summarizing the list. Commission members were asked to give more thought to other potential nominees and bring suggestions to the next meeting.

NEW BUSINESS

Main Street Design Committee.

Ms. Davis reported on the meeting she attended for the Downtown Design Committee. The committee discussed upcoming downtown events and also seem to be very interested in murals. They are also committed to gateway signage. Ms. Davis invited other HDC members to attend the next meeting to support the committee.

On the subject of murals, Mr. Bockmiller noted that he has been speaking with the owner of the laundry building next to the Armory on North Potomac Street. This is a large blank wall and the goal is to get the owner to fix up the façade of the laundromat building. Ms. Allen stated that the surrounding neighborhood needs to be taken into account in that a mural could be an invitation for graffiti.

OLD BUSINESS

None.

ANNOUNCEMENTS

- Education credits for the CLG report are needed so the report can be submitted for the last fiscal year. Ms. Allen asked if a mini course on the Arts and Crafts style would count toward credits for next year. She is considering enrolling in an online class. Staff stated that a class on that subject would count toward the educational requirements of the CLG program.

**Historic District Commission
MINUTES**

**March 24, 2016
City of Hagerstown, Maryland**

- Mr. Gehr reminded members that baseball season is around the corner. The Hagerstown Suns season begins April 7. He will need to miss three meetings in a row in May and again toward the end of the season. Ms. Davis, the vice chair, noted that she will be out of town in August.

ADJOURN

It was moved and seconded that the meeting adjourn (5:50 p.m.).

4/14/2016

Approved



Debra C. Calhoun – Secretary