

Michael Gehr, chair, called the meeting to order at 4:36 p.m. on Thursday, September 13, 2012, in the Fourth Floor Conference Room, City Hall. A roster of the members of the commission and the technical slots they fill are on file and available upon request. Also present were commission members S. Dozier, V. Hrabal, P. Reed, S. Silas, and M. Wertman. S. Bockmiller, Development Planner/Zoning Administrator and D. Calhoun, Secretary, were present on behalf of the Planning and Code Administration Division.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES: August 13, 2012

The minutes were not ready for approval.

CONSENT AGENDA

121 West Antietam Street - Diane De Laet - Fence, Case No. HDC 2012-34

114 North Potomac Street - Wish Kitchens and Baths - Sign and Grant, Case No. HDC 2012-35

MOTION: (Wertman/Dozier) Mr. Chairman, I have reviewed the materials submitted in Cases HDC 2012-34 and 35 and Grant Application HDC 2012-35, and their associated staff reports and recommendations, and I have viewed the properties in question. The Staff reports recommend approval of these applications as consistent with the applicable standards adopted by this commission, and no one has appeared at this hearing with concerns about, issues with, or objections to these applications. Therefore, I move that this commission adopt the staff evaluations and recommendations in these cases as its own and grant Certificates of Appropriateness to the applicants for Cases 2012-34 and 35 and grant application 2012-35.

DISCUSSION: None.

ACTION: APPROVED (Unanimous)

DESIGN REVIEW

31-33 South Potomac Street - First Hagerstown Hose Co. - Facade Repair, Window Replacement, and Grant, Case No. HDC 2012-33

Ray Lushbaugh, Secretary, First Hagerstown Hose Company; Steve Luhouse, Estimator, Callas Contractors; and Kevin Huffman, Hagerstown Paint & Glass, were present.

Staff Report: This building is a B resource in the Downtown Local Historic District. First Hagerstown Hose Co. is requesting a facade grant to repair the South Potomac Street facade and the belfry, including repainting and stabilization of the decorative elements. Replacement windows are proposed for the front facade and will be aluminum-clad made by Eagle Talon (Anderson) to match as closely as possible the original muntin configuration. All decorative elements will be replicated; chimneys will be repointed. Existing enclosed fanlights and window sashes will be replaced and louvers/air conditioning units will be removed. Staff recommended approval. The replacement window model selected effectively reproduces the historic Queen Anne window grille pattern.

Mr. Bockmiller gave the new HDC members background information on the use of replacement windows in historic districts. The commission's Design Guidelines were amended to allow for replacement windows, regardless of whether the original windows are still operable. Substitute materials are permitted as long as the model selected does effectively replicate the historic windows. In this situation some of the historic windows had been enclosed with window air conditioning units and fanlights were closed in. Under the fire company's proposal, the lower sashes will be replaced by single light windows. All air conditioning units and modern windows will be eliminated. Historic photos show no grilles in the louver sashes. The upper levels will have the grilles. Third floor windows historically also show a ladder pattern. The windows are a major architectural element on this building; staff cautioned that commission members that they should look at the proposed replacement windows closely for that reason.

Applicant/Commission Discussion: Mr. Lushbaugh stated that First Hagerstown Hose Company is proud of its history and invited the commission to come down and take a tour. Kevin Huffman of Hagerstown Paint & Glass, Windows and Doors. The windows proposed to be used by the fire company are an aluminum extrusion, with defined edges, even on the sash. A putty line is built into it the window. The high-definition grilles come in many widths and between the glass is a simulated divided light. The grilles are manufactured by hand so they can replicate almost any grille pattern. Dr. Reed asked about the moulin between the sash and whether it will be replaced. Mr. Huffman stated that the existing usually remains. Mr. Luhouse of Callas said the moulin will be cleaned up and repaired and painted. Transoms will be replaced as well. The arch windows will be a single pane. The glass will be high-performance Low E glass which is slightly tinted but provides UV protection.

The shape of the grilles will be the same as the existing. The depth of the muntins will be as close to the historic windows as possible. Insulated glass dictates that the grilles are not as deep.

There is a variety of window styles on the building so in order to replicate the historical appearance, they need to look at the variety and work with it. Mr. Bockmiller stated that the replacement windows need to resemble the historic windows as close as possible for the particular window they are working with. Mr. Huffman promised to pay attention to the different sizes to make sure each grille fills up the same amount of space on the window.

Concerning the building color, Mr. Lushbaugh said the building will be repainted in a similar paint scheme (red brick, white trim). All trim work will be replaced in-kind.

MOTION: (Hrabal/Wertman) Mr. Chairman, I have inspected the project plans and the property in question and if constructed in accordance with these plans, the project is compatible with the character of the district for the reasons that the materials being used and the patterns being used on replacement windows will replicate as close as possible the existing patterns and in some cases go back to the original pattern on the second floor windows, and the general form and proportion are in harmony with the Architectural Guidelines for the Downtown Historic District and the character of the adjoining properties. Therefore, I move the HDC grant a Certificate of Appropriateness to the applicant for Case No. 2012-33 and the grant application for the same case.

DISCUSSION: None.

ACTION: APPROVED (Unanimous)

WORKSHOP:

1003 The Terrace - J. Ramsay Farah - Enclose Front Porch

Dr. J. Ramsay Farah, 1003 The Terrace, Hagerstown, Maryland, and Mike Fraley, Sunquest, Inc., were present.

Mr. Bockmiller explained that staff encouraged Dr. Farah to have a workshop with the commission to discuss an unusual concept for his house at the corner of The Terrace and West Hillcrest Road. The style of the house is a pseudo-Spanish style house with a front porch that spans the front of the building, hidden mostly by a large bank of shrubs which cannot be taken

into account by the commission since the shrubs are removable. Dr. Farah would like to enclose the covered front porch with sliders in the various openings across the front and on the left side insert a frame wall that would contain a solid mahogany door and two small windows on either side of the door. The contractor has provided photo simulations of the interior of the porch showing the sliders. The existing metal railings will remain. Staff was concerned about how this work could be done, that if a future owner wanted to reverse it, could the work be done so that it creates the least amount of damage to the porch. The porch is a defining architectural feature of the house.

Dr. Farah stated that they do not plan to use brick or concrete on the porch. The proposed wall with the new door will be framed with vertical tongue-and-groove cedar. Wall will be stained the same color as the door. The two windows ("speak eases") are for security so his family can see who is at the door. The frame wall will be on the end of the porch and will face Hillcrest Road. The wood framing will be placed inside the arch and anchored into the mortar of the brick.

Dr. Reed stated that since the porch is an important visual feature of how the house was designed originally, that when you are done, passersby still get a sense that the area was a porch at one time. The glass sliders should be recessed back slightly. Dr. Farah said the materials they plan to use mimic exactly what is there (transom, the white trim, retaining the balustrade). The glass will actually protect the railing from the elements since it will be behind the glass on the interior of the space. The glass will be tinted slightly green to match the green tile roof and contrast with the white trim. They researched door styles to try to match the Spanish Revival style of the house.

Mr. Bockmiller asked Dr. Reed to comment on how the new materials play into historic preservation. Obviously, the commission does not want something that is going to trick passersby into thinking that the new work is an historic element of the building. Staff was looking for guidance as far as the particular model of the slider window chosen. Dr. Reed said the model shown is fine, but suggested painting the trim a color that would help it recede rather than white. If someone is standing at the street at the end of the front yard looking at the front of the building, the whole window disappears and the only thing visible is the porch. Instead of painting the mullions between the sliders and the transoms white, paint them dark so it is not as visible. Dr. Farah stated that they want to use white frames because they will match all the other window frames on the house. The first floor windows under the porch are not visible now because the porch is 11 feet deep. No matter what he puts out there, the internal windows will not be visible from the street. Dr. Reed said the central theme is to try to minimize the change in appearance from the original design. Mr. Gehr agreed that using a darker color on the slider mullions and pushing it back as far as possible between the brick piers. A darker glass will push it back as well.

Mr. Gehr asked if the existing decorative railing around the porch is centered between the piers and whether there will be enough room for the sliders. Dr. Farah said there is enough room for

the sliders to sit on the concrete. The method of attachment of the railing to the brick will not be impacted by the slider windows.

Mr. Bockmiller asked about the exterior material on the wood frame wall. Does the commission have any concerns about the use of tongue-and-groove which will create vertical lines. Also, because this is a front porch enclosure (an architectural element on the front of the building visible from the streetscape) Mr. Bockmiller asked that the commission look at the circumstances of this particular project to determine unique characteristics of the property to prevent other property owners for using this example as an excuse to do the same thing to their front porches. He cited the distance from The Terrace and the hedges around the porch as possible unique conditions. When the design review application is being reviewed, there needs to be differentiation why this is an acceptable alteration to a front of a building. Dr. Reed pointed out that the side of the porch where the door will be added is pretty close to Hillcrest Road. Dr. Farah stated it is approximately 50 feet from Hillcrest and is elevated and hidden by trees and a hedge. Mr. Gehr said he is not concerned about the verticalness with the wood wall because it will replicate the door to some extent. As long as the door is a darker stain it will recede. Mr. Bockmiller stated that when the actual application comes in, the motion should mention the site circumstances as far as why the commission is approving the enclosure of a front porch which is a character-defining feature on a building.

On the rear portion of the property Dr. Farah would like to put an addition on an existing garage which is too small for the family's vehicle. Mr. Bockmiller stated that the addition will be fairly large with large expanses of facade space. Staff recommended to the applicant during their initial meeting that the wall space be broken up by including some regularly spaced windows. The drawing originally proffered by Dr. Farah showed two-story, 30-foot blank walls with no fenestration. Generally, the area where the garage will be placed is not visible from public ways. Dr. Reed noted that the existing parking area is visible from Hillcrest Road. Dr. Farah agreed that the garage addition will be visible because he plans to attach it to an existing deck. The 50-year scalloped shingles will mimic the tile roof on the primary building. Dr. Farah stated that they would like to use brick on the first floor of the garage and shingles on the second floor and wanted to know if that would be something that the HDC would approve or should it be all one material (brick or shingles). It will be hard to match new brick to the brick on the original buildings. In addition, he would like to avoid making the addition look like it was built at the same time as the house and the garage. Dr. Reed agreed that new additions should be distinguishable from the old, but they should also be compatible with the primary structure. She did not have concerns about the shingles on the addition. The roof angles should be similar to the roof angles on the main house and if shingles are used, they should give the impression of tile. She noted that metal roofing material is available that mimics tile roof material. Dr. Farah stated that the shingle material is durable and will help distinguish the new work from the old. (Dr. Reed left the meeting.)

Mr. Bockmiller noted that there are several outstanding zoning issues concerning the garage since in order to meet the ordinance, the garage needs to be attached to the house and not the deck. There are zoning limitations on the size of an accessory structure; however, if the garage is attached to the house it would be considered an addition to the house and there would be no limitation on the size. It cannot be a free standing building.

**1014 Hamilton Boulevard - Greg Maciulla - Remove and Replace Stucco,
Case No. HDC 2009-35**

Mr. Bockmiller reported that Mr. Maciulla received approval from the HDC in 2009 to redo the stucco on his house. Difficulties have arisen in trying to apply the stucco to the house, and Mr. Maciulla would like to substitute a stucco board material. At a staff level, Mr. Bockmiller was comfortable with the material substitution but it constitutes enough of a change that he felt the commission should review the change.

Mr. Maciulla stated that the substitute material will be EFIS which is the same as stucco. Currently there is a cement product behind there and he would like to replace it with a cement board. The cement board will actually make it flush with the trim. If he uses styrofoam it will push it out a little further, in which case the edges will be chamfered near the trim to help it blend better. Mr. Gehr said that the final finish will be the same regardless of whether it is a cement board or whether it is over the styrofoam insulation. From the exterior, passersby will not notice a difference. Commission members did not have any concerns about the substitution proposed by Mr. Maciulla.

NEW BUSINESS:

None.

OLD BUSINESS:

- **Maryland Association of Historic District Commissions (MAHDC) Training Sessions.**

Staff approached the commission about possible dates in November for the training sessions that MAHDC has offered to conduct for historic district commission in the area. After discussion, staff will contact MAHDC about scheduling the session for Monday, November 5, either at 5:30 or 6:00 p.m. The session will last about three hours.

ANNOUNCEMENTS

- Staff reminded commission members about the exhibit table for the 250th Anniversary Celebration on Saturday, September 29, from 10:00 a.m. until 4:00 p.m.. Ms. Hrabal and Ms. Wertman volunteered to help all day; Mr. Gehr said he could lend a hand for about an hour in the morning around 10:00. The table will be located on the first block of West Washington Street.
- In the evening on September 29, the City is premiering its second Civil War video, entitled *Divided Valor* at the Bridge of Life Church on South Potomac Street at 7:00 p.m.. Video will highlight the roles of six individuals in the Civil War.
- Ms. Hrabal noted that the two vacancies on the commission need to be advertised on Hagerstown's government channel.

ADJOURN: It was moved and seconded that the meeting adjourn (5:50 p.m.).

10/16/2012
Date


Debra C. Calhoun - Secretary